# **FOGOAC**

November 15,2022 9:30 a.m. – 4:00 p.m.

Theme/Goal: Draft Report

Members in Attendance: Frieda Takamura, Commission on Asian Pacific American Affairs

Representative Sharon Tomiko Santos, House of Representatives Tennille Jefferies-Simmons, Alternate, Office of Superintendent of

**Public Instruction** 

Bill Kallappa, Governor's Office of Indian Affairs

Erin Okuno, Office of Education Ombuds Tyson Marsh, alternate for Dr. Jim Smith

Representative Lillian Ortiz-Self, House of Representatives

Staff and Public Attendees: Maria Flores, Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction

Heather Rees, Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction Andrew Nelson, Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction

Devin Noel-Harrison, Office of Superintendent of Public

Instruction

Lauren Gilmore, Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction

Michael S. Gilson, Acting Assistant Professor, UW

Jason R. Kilmer, Associate Professor, UW

Nicole Fossos-Wong, Research Scientist, UW

Tana Peterman, Senior Program Officer, WA STEM

Jenee Myers Twitchell, Chief Impact & Policy Officer, WA STEM Henedina Tavares, Contractor & former WA STEM Community

Partner Fellow

Alejandra Perez, Director of Education Strategy, Scholar Fund Becky Wallace, Assistant Supt., Secondary Education and Pathway

Preparation, OSPI

Samantha Sanders, Director, Career & Technical Education,

Secondary Education and Pathway Preparation, OSPI

Andrew Estep, WSPTA

Arielle Mathews

Christian Stark, OSPI

Christie Robertson

Christine Katamaya

Demetricia Hodges

Erica Hernandez-Scott, PESB

Jay Raadt

Jeanie Kent, Program Manager CCT ECE/HS

Jen Chong Jewell

Jocelyn Granados

Josh Apata

Kathleen Lawrence

**Kerry Blomquist** 

Mandy Paradise

Nasue Nishida

Radu Smintina

Rebecca Purser

Sarah Albertson

Seema Bahl, SBE

Stephanie Nelson

Suzie Hanson

**Trenise Rogers** 

Vicki Butler

Randy Spaulding, SBE

Roz Thompson, AWSP

Roots of Inclusion

Kia Franklin, Stand WA

Members Not in Attendance: Superintendent Chris Reykdal, Office of Superintendent of Public

Instruction

Vacant, Senate Ranking Minority Member

Dr. Randy Nuñez, Commission on Hispanic American Affairs

Nicole Sutton, alternate for Bill Kallappa

Representative Alex Ybarra, House of Representatives

Lydia Faitalia, Alternate for Fiasili Savusa

Fiasili Savusa, Commission on Asian Pacific American Affairs

Michael Peña, Alternate, Commission on Hispanic American

**Affairs** 

Danielle Eidenberg, alternate for Carrie Basas

Brianne Ramos, alternate for Frieda Takamura

Senator Bob Hasegawa, Senate

Senator Lisa Wellman, Senate

Dr. Jim Smith, Commission on African American Affairs

Yordanos Gebreamlak, Office of Education Ombuds

# Minutes

Agenda item: Introductions, Agenda Overview, and Outside Committee Updates

Facilitator: Maria Flores, Executive Director, CISL, OSPI

## **Announcements**

- Update on Billy Frank Jr Day
- The Commission on Asian Pacific American Affairs (CAPAA) will be holding a meeting on 11/19 with updates from the EOGOAC. Anyone who would like to add to this can reach out.
- The EOGOAC would like to acknowledge Bill, Fiasili, Frieda and Heather's Birthdays. Up

Agenda item: Drafting EOGOAC Recommendations

#### Presenters:

- Maria Flores, Executive Director, CISL, OSPI
- Heather Rees, Research and Policy Development Program Manager,

### Discussion:

- Review notes/fill in gaps
- Identify questions for staff/others

## Comments:

# EOGOAC stated:

• See attached recommendation notes sheet for discussion

Agenda item: School Climate: Recommendations and Guidance for Washington State

# Presenters:

- Michael S. Gilson, Acting Assistant Professor, UW
- Jason R. Kilmer, Associate Professor, UW
- Nicole Fossos-Wong, Research Scientist, UW

# Discussion:

- Assessing School Climate Survey
- Assessing School Climate Model
- School Climate Report and Reccomendations

# Comments:

#### **EOGOAC** stated:

- Would like to know if they have a breakdown of the people of color who were interviewed for the study and the positions they held.
- Would like to recommend that in the future the researchers consider disaggregating their data for people of color and their positions for reliability and a more comprehensive view of supporting the school system.
- Would like to know if the research team worked with the Washington Education Association (WEA).
- Would like to state concern about how the research done in Washington state is not considering and reflecting communities of color.
- Would like to address concerns about using the notion of "grit" as a measurable aspect
  of the research, since this has been significantly challenged within education research as
  dangerous to minoritized communities. Measuring motivation does not account for
  those experiencing structural or institutional racism and should not be considered when
  measuring social emotional learning (SEL).
- Would like further information on the equity piece of the school climate concept, and if
  it was used to measure access beyond resources to account for people's culture.
- Would like to address concerns that the lens of equity is not being accurately used in this research based on how the data was collected and disaggregated.
- Would like to recommend that the researchers return to this paper and work with experts to disaggregate responses to provide an equitable look at school climate for people of color working in education.
- Would like to know if school climate and school voice are synonymous with one another
  or different in the context for this work.
- Would like to know if communities were surveyed about using student voice as a measurement of school climate.
- Would like to address concerns about the research team politicizing the issue of school climate by choosing to highlight the negative comments of the survey responses.
- Would like to know if the team worked with the UW College of Education.
- Would like to follow up with the State Board for further information on contracting this research.

# Agenda item: Public Comment

- Individual 1:
  - Would like to state as a principle, that school climate and culture are foci in professional development with many resources available through the National School Leader Collaborative. The individual provided examples of how this measurement with the eight state criteria can be used with students to improve schools and the Association of Washington Student Leaders (AWSL) can assist.
- Individual 2:

- Would like to address concerns about the validity of this research and how the research team has used the term "grit" and how this harms students of color.
- Would like to address concerns that equity was not the key focus of this research and that communities were not involved and able to engage in this process.
- Would also like to state that health and safety should be a measurement of school climate.
- Individual 3:
- Would like this research to be transparent and available to parents and communities to be strategic partners in improving school climate.
- Would like the data disaggregated and provides intersectionality for schools and communities to really see and understand students.
- Would like to address concerns about the harm that can be caused by blanket statements.

# Individual 4:

- Would like to state that to improve school climate, the process needs to involve a learning experience for those working in the community.
- Would like to recommend that in addition to a state climate survey we also provide school climate actions with goals to provide outcomes.
- Would like to recommend that communities create their own research model and bring forward their voice, rather than fitting into a model created outside of those communities.

Agenda item: Lunch Offline

Agenda item: Washington STEM: High School to Postsecondary Project

#### Presenters:

- Tana Peterman, Senior Program Officer, WA STEM
- Jenee Myers Twitchell, Chief Impact & Policy Officer, WA STEM
- Henedina Tavares, Contractor & former WA STEM Community Partner Fellow
- Alejandra Perez, Director of Education Strategy, Scholar Fund

### Discussion:

- Scholar Fund
- Seeking input, guidance and connections on work to increase post-secondary awareness, readiness and direct enrollment
- The big picture of post-secondary awareness
- Student advice to improve credit classes, advising and participation
- Parent voice and recommendations

- Key Findings: Staff comments and student interviews
- High School to Post-Secondary Study

#### Comments:

## **EOGOAC Stated:**

- Would like to know if mastery-based learning is being considered in their big picture.
- Would like clarification on what is meant by "demands from schools;", whether it is from within the school or outside.
- Would like to know if there is another route beside post-secondary enrollment to look at other aspirations.
- Would like to address the structural concerns that teacher and student post-secondary aspirations are so unaligned.
- Would like clarification on how CTE dual credits are being offered and if they are different from AP courses.
- Would like further clarifications on the information and tone the slides are presenting.
- Would like to state that we need to be careful in the labeling of over-representation and under-representation in classrooms to ensure all options are remaining open for students.
- Would like further information on the structure of advisories and if they build staff awareness and confidence in being able to support student exploration around postsecondary.
- Would like to know how first-generation students are defined.
- Would like more information on when the study was completed.
- Would like further information on how Covid influenced the questions, responses, and feedback of their study.

**Agenda item:** Flexible Credit Policy, CTE Graduation Pathways, and Work-Integrated Learning Advisory Committee Updates

#### **Presenters:**

- Becky Wallace, Assistant Supt., Secondary Education and Pathway Preparation, OSPI
- Samantha Sanders, Director, Career & Technical Education, Secondary Education and Pathway Preparation, OSPI

# **Discussion:**

- Credit Flexibility
- Career and Technical Education (cte)Graduation Pathways
- Work-Integral Learning Advisory Committee (WILAC) Updates

#### **Comments:**

**EOGOAC Stated:** 

- Would like further information on why the work experience credit is going to be advanced via rule writing as opposed to legislation.
- Would like clarification on the need of local CTE sequence approval to meet local workforce issues.
- Would like further information on why CTE is limiting its disaggregated data to only the federal categories.
- Would like to state a need for data categories to be further disaggregated to meet the needs of the community.
- Would like further clarification on how sixteen CTE career clusters are housed within six OSPI CTE program areas. Specifically, are one or more of these clusters de-emphasized?
- Would like to confirm that each cluster item has a CTSO associated with it.

## Agenda item: Public Comment

### Individual 1

 The first person asked a clarifying question regarding the CTE presentation, stating that there was not a meaningful change for certain pathways with students of color and if there has been consideration for why this is occurring. Specifically, is there disproportionate access to these programs?

#### Individual 2

 A parent would like to state concerns about access to CTE programs due to the difficulties of the schools to keep and retain teachers that can maintain these opportunities. They expressed frustration that the low-performing schools within their district are missing these opportunities that could benefit the students.

## • Individual 3

 A parent would like to express frustration that based on the current pathways, that students are not able to take algebra before high school which makes completion of higher-level math such as calculus in school difficult. They also expressed concern about the lower percentage of post-secondary enrollment by men.

# Individual 4

- The executive director of the state board came to answer a request of further background information and an understanding of why the UW climate survey presented earlier in the day was conducted.
  - The EOGOAC stated concerns about some of the ways the research was conducted and presented and what the final report will state regarding communities of color.
  - The EOGOAC would like to suggest that in the future presenters understand that the legislative mandate of the committee is understanding and recommending policy that closes the opportunity gap for students of color.

Agenda item: Drafting EOGOAC Recommendations Continued

### **Presenters**:

Heather Rees, Research and Policy Development Program Manager, CISL, OSPI

#### Discussion:

• Developing and reviewing reccomendations for school climate and CTE following the presentations.

# Comments:

### EOGOAC Stated:

• See attached recommendation notes sheet for discussion

Agenda item: Review Workplan and Conclude Meeting

• Facilitator: Heather Rees, Research and Policy Development Program Manager, CISL, OSPI

# Discussion:

- Overview of the workplan for the end of the year
- Next Meeting: December 14, 2022
- Topic: Draft Report
- Guests:
  - Project Education Impact Report
  - ERDC Critical Questions Feedback

Meeting concluded at [4:00 pm]

Minutes Taken By: Lauren Gilmore, Research Analyst, OSPI

# **EOGOAC Recommendation Notes**

# April – Topic: Educator Workforce

- Still need to hear what the standards are and how they align, for educators and governance
- Keep an eye on fees

- Review recommendations around residency
- Go deeper into legislation in 2016, and 1139 breakdown the goals, breakdown of the siloes
- Go over the details of the Collaborative report
- Panel of education researchers who are people of color

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation (who needs to do what)
Need research on the issues from the perspective of the communities  Using the same researchers and expecting different results	Funding? Contracting?  Want researchers of color and from our community  Put research out for bid – WIMBE?  - What are other states doing?	Who needs to do what?
What issues does this address?	Apprenticeships Expand work integrated opportunities	
Mentors need support -mentor 101 -receive clock hours for training		
Siloed work Incompatibility No vertical alignment	Consistency in CCDEI standards Compatible – statewide standards Differentiated measures	
Increased challenges for board members	WSSDA provide training and coaching for school board directors on dealing with difficult discussion with the public and messaging	

Need for accountability	Monitoring of alignment with state standards Articulate the expectations, measurements What are the outcomes that we want?	
Picking up from the work of the Collaborative (1139) for response to educator shortage	EOGOAC hear more, support this work?	
<ul><li>Recruitment</li><li>Mentorship</li><li>Residency</li><li>Financial supports</li></ul>	What is the current status?/upcoming shortage?	

# May – Topic: Attendance/Truancy

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation
Need a measure of engagement in the SQSS measures of the WSIF	Add measure of school climate to the WSIF  Need more work on what school climate is measuring exactly  Must be culturally competent measurement  Important for addressing the needs of students — emphasis on student voice	Who should do what?  - OSPI – need to update the ESSEA plan  - SBE?/OSPI who should be adopting/implementing the climate survey  - Withholding judgment still believe it is important  - Instrument must not measure climate based on old institutional knowledge, informed by perspective of the community  - Reframe the issue  - Work with WEA,  - Not a burden or a threat

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation
CEB boards need to reflect the community -Include small nonprofits -Tribal representatives  The appointment process should be broader, involve the community  Need for student voice  SD be involved, not just the courts (squish the siloes) — need more information about the composition, what are the best practices?	Stipends? Allowable but need funding allocated specifically for CEB members	The Legislature specifically allocation funding for the provision of stipends for CEB members who are eligible under SB5793
Need for fully disaggregated data reported by districts  - Use for board appointments	HB1541 only required districts to collect and OSPI to report, districts need to include in reports as well	Districts included how?
Don't have base-level information about the use and membership of CEBs	Need data on CEB board membership  - Demographics - Composition – who is running them (court, SD, ESD) - Funding costs and source	Who should collect and report? One-time or ongoing?  The CEB should collect and use disaggregated data — intersection of k-12 and judiciary should use the same categories as CEDARS — ALL state agencies adopt the disaggregated sub categories
Prep programs need to include how to address absenteeism (for teachers and administrators)	PESB incorporate into work on CCDEI standards  Ensure the prep programs have training for educators	
Understanding cultural leave	to develop the skills to	

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation
Example N. Thurston and Yelm with Nisqually part of gov to gov relationship. Work together locally  Leaves of absence for religious or	understand and address absenteeism from a place of cultural competency (understand own bias)	
School boards need to be involved	WSSDA address model policies on CEBs and attendance/truancy - Make sure they exist and are culturally competent	
CC of CEB working with community	Government to Government training for CEB members	Is this an update to RCW or WAC?
Need to consult with tribes and have representation for students – advocate for the student (native students are dual citizen)  - Ensure access to an advocate (not just allowed by the SD)	Working together enriches the whole system	Membership
For non-tribal students/families, also allowed to include community advocate		
Advocate: chosen by family, not SD staff, extended timeline to accommodate, helps navigate the system		
Derived from constitutional positive right to basic education		

June – Topic: Graduation and Career Pathways

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation
Lack of communication to families on pathway options, system too complicated	Incorporate student voice Work with ethnic commissions	Who needs to do what?
Need for language access – translation and interpretation	Multilingual staff and CBOs	
Research needs (specifically on needs and outcomes for student of color) -  • Looking ahead at class of 2024 – needs and opportunities for students of color  • Research on students of color who did not graduate  • Disparities as a result of core 24	Reach out to ethnic commissions involve in conversations on research questions	Require consultation with commissions in developing scoping questions
No consistency in platforms for HSBPs – no access to data	Provide Statewide platform  - Training – roles for all adults in the system (not just counselors), robust and implemented with fidelity  - Utilize data at the state level  - Translated for parent access and education  - Cross-connection with postsecondary opportunities	Who needs to do what?
	uniformity	

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation
Streamline 8 <sup>th</sup> to 9 <sup>th</sup> transition support. Student learning plan redundant	Eliminate student learning plans?	
Counselors don't have the time to do all the reporting and meet 1:1 with students	Data support role to help counselors with reporting and data entry	Who needs to do what?
Barriers to apprenticeship and pre-apprenticeship programs for students of color	L&I partner with EOGOAC and WILAC work together to address barriers for students of color  Opportunities and pathways in state gov. into public service	Who needs to do what?
Inclusion of disaggregated data in reports	Reminder of the "why" this is important Give examples Change in demographics	
Lack of deliberate inclusion and collaboration with ethnic commissions  Commissions need the resources to handle the requests	Reminder of past recommendations, not to tokenize but genuine inclusion and collaboration EOGOAC should not have to remind every time Tie to renewal of studies  Require agencies to work directly with the ethnic commissions	Legislature require (?) that Whenever there is a change in graduation or pathway requirements, agencies must work directly with the ethnic commissions and GOIA  Additional resources for the ethnic commissions to do this work

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation
	Mastery Based learning as a comprehensive approach to providing opportunity to every student instead of layering on and on and on to try to make the system fit modern needs	
	Can't just only focus on college. Post secondary success no matter what that looks like. Transferable knowledge and skills.	

# July – Topic: Research on the Gap

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation
Only system that is disaggregating the data to this level is k-12	Comprehensive approach	Who needs to do what?  The leg should require that
Students' identity is not recognized outside of the K-12 data Hampers ERDC ability to see data across systems		agencies reporting to ERDC should use the disaggregated categories (cite RCW) Includes: WSAC, workforce board, DCYF (early learning, inst. ed, child welfare), DSHS
		ANDwe believe that any agency collecting and reporting data related to students should use the same disaggregated categories

	Periodic check on the organization of the categories and the use of them — implementation  Take a look at the first full sets of data	Who: OSPI reconvene task force What: review the initial set of data and clarifications/updates needed Continue periodic checks as needed
Not seeing robust community representation on workgroups/committees etc.  EOGOAC being spread too thin  State agencies not conferring with the ethnic	How state agencies can do a better job interfacing with and collaborating with the ethnic commissions/GOIA	Who: What:

Notes from discussion on focus and framing of the "gap studies":

- Context, background
- Reminder of the ask and why

# What

- Commissioning of 5 new studies (one for each community represented)
- An analysis of what progress has been made and what there is left to do
- Examples of tangible successes (ask how)
- Crosswalk to recommendations from the EOGOAC
- Recommendations for future work
  - Schools, districts, state agencies

# Why

- To assess where we have been and where we are, where we go next
- Communities see themselves

## Who

- Ethnic commissions and GOIA/TLC
- Each ethnic commission guide each study individually
- In-state researchers
- Multi-disciplinary approach

#### When

- 23-25 biennium now 2-years for this work
  - o Reports due in 2024 (for 2025 session)
- Funding would start July 1, 2023. Work could begin once budget confirmed

#### How

- Community driven and community voice
  - No template, honor and value the diversity
- Deliberate about the inclusion of immigrants and refugees of color language access needs/costs
- Strengths-based
- Include student-voice, workforce perspective and business community
- Use mixed-methods approach
- Use member checking
- Look at narratives of the community beyond data points
- Values: pride in community and lived experience (researchers take a look at what gives a sense of pride to students), solidarity with communities of color, trust (how do we communicate trusting communities to be the experts in their experiences, trust the voice of the community as the experts, recognizing past harm and ways that research has not established trust)
- Researchers partner with each other and share best practices
- Partner with EOGOAC
  - EOGOAC a receiver of the report
  - Maybe partner is the not the right word here
  - Giving feedback
  - Elevate the reports to the communities
- 1) What is the role of the EOGOAC?
  - a) Should there be a synthesis report? due date?
  - b) How will the reports impact the goals of the EOGOAC?
    - a. Potentially update the statutory charge of the EOGOAC studies include recommendations including amendment language

Sept – Topic: Mental and Behavioral Health and SEL

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation (who needs to do what)
Preparation for educators to be able to support students		
EOGOAC needs to hear more about proposed bill for analysis of community ACES and impact on students in school, environment factors, conditions – impact mental and behavioral health. Old study in 2015 (look at) (find bill)		
Don't have appropriate amount of data to monitor implementation and the impact of implementation of SEL	Need progress monitoring How it's been incorporated and it's impact on the space	
Missing robust ways to reach out to communities of color in this work – need to talk more about how to make this happen		
Not hearing enough about how race factors into the experience of "the issue" (SEL and others) intersection with the other factors		

Topic: Other

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation
Alignment of disaggregated data across the systems – reminder to governor's healthcare disparities workgroup about breaking down silos and barriers. Lack of coordination creates challenges for education. (possibly collaborate)	See below	
Unequitable access to graduation pathways	Support for SBE requirement that LEAs examine data for disproportionality in pathway use(?)	
Only system that is disaggregating the data to this level is k-12  Students' identity is not recognized outside of the K-12 data  Hampers ERDC ability to see data across systems	Comprehensive approach	Who needs to do what?  The leg should require that agencies reporting to ERDC should use the disaggregated categories (cite RCW) Includes: WSAC, workforce board, DCYF (early learning, inst. ed, child welfare), DSHS  ANDwe believe that any agency collecting and reporting data related to students should use the same disaggregated categories

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation
districts also need help collecting and using this data	Periodic check on the organization of the categories and the use of them – implementation  Take a look at the first full sets of data	Who: OSPI reconvene task force What: review the initial set of data and clarifications/updates needed Continue periodic checks as needed
Not seeing robust community representation on workgroups/committees etc.  EOGOAC being spread too thin  State agencies not conferring with the ethnic commissions/GOIA	How state agencies can do a better job interfacing with and collaborating with the ethnic commissions/GOIA	Who: What:

# Month – Topic:

The issue/challenge	The possible solution	The possible recommendation

### Words matter

• Ex. "rigor". What does that look like for each student and what impression does this word give?

# Parking Lot/Follow-up:

- The EOGOAC should come to consensus on what we mean about how MTSS and WISSP interact
- Need more updated data based on recently passed legislation refresh on what has been done (staffing allocations)
- We need to think about the root causes of these issues outside of the classroom that
  impact students can be outside education (with race front and center to the
  discussion) do a root cause analysis. Not relying on schools and educators to solve all
  these problems there are other systems that have a role. Education is a part of the
  overall solution.
- How are we serving small and rural districts to do this work? Who is best to deliver what supports be careful with the deployment method
- Training for parents
- Revisit EOGOAC mandates
- OEO history, purpose and charge
- Explore inclusion of early learning in definition of basic education
  - Address the opportunity and achievement gaps early as possible
  - Also change the focus of the EOGOAC to include early ed